United Nations A/CN.4/718/Add.1

General Assembly

Distr.: General
21 June 2018
Original: English

International Law Commission
Seventieth session
New York, 30 April–1 June 2018
Geneva, 2 July–10 August 2018

Fifth report on the provisional application of treaties

By Juan Manuel Gómez-Robledo, Special Rapporteur

Addendum

Contents

		Page
	Annex I. Provisional application of treaties: selected bibliography	2
A.	Books	2
B.	Articles and book chapters	3
C.	Case law	5
D.	Resolutions and decisions by international organizations	6
E.	Other documents	7

18-10198 (E) 020718

Please recycle

Annex I

Provisional application of treaties: selected bibliography

A. Books

Aust, Anthony, *Modern Treaty Law and Practice*, 2nd ed., Cambridge University Press, 2007.

_____, "Article 24", in Olivier Corten and Pierre Klein (eds.), *The Vienna Conventions on the Law of Treaties: A Commentary*, vol. II, Oxford University Press, 2011.

Azaria, Danae, *Treaties on Transit of Energy via Pipelines and Countermeasures*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2015.

Bjorge, Eirik, *The Evolutionary Interpretation of Treaties*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2014.

Flaesch-Mougin, Catherine and Isabelle Bosse-Platière, "L'application provisoire des accords de l'Union européenne", *The European Union in the World: Essays in Honour of Marc Maresceau*, Govaere, Inge, et al. (eds.) Leiden, Netherlands, Martinus Nijhoff Publishers, 2014.

García, J., *La aplicación provisional de los tratados. La celebración de tratados internacionales por España: problemas actuales*, Madrid, Ministerio de Asuntos Exteriores, 1990.

Geslin, Albane, *La mise en application provisoire des traités*, Paris, Editions A. Pedone, 2005.

Gomaa, Mohammed M., *Suspension or Termination of Treaties on Grounds of Breach*, Kluwer Law International, 1996.

Grignon, Julia, *L'applicabilité temporelle du droit international humanitaire*, Geneva, Schulthess, 2013.

Gutiérrez Baylón, Juan de Dios, *Derecho de los Tratados*, Editorial Porrúa, 2010.

Klabbers, Jan and René Lefeber, (eds.), *Essays on the Law of Treaties: A Collection of Essays in Honour of Bert Vierdag*, The Hague, Kluwer Law International, 1998.

Osminin, B. I., *The Adoption and Implementation by States of International Treaty Obligations*, Wolters Kluwer, 2006.

Quast Mertsch, Anneliese, *Provisionally Applied Treaties: Their Binding Force and Legal Nature*, Fitzmaurice, Malgosia, et al. (eds.), Queen Mary Studies in International Law, vol. 9, Martinus Nijhoff, 2012.

_____, "The reform measures of ECHR Protocol No. 14 and the provisional application of treaties", in Fitzmaurice, Malgosia, et al. (eds.), *The Interpretation and Application of the European Convention of Human Rights: Legal and Practical Implications*, Queen Mary Studies in International Law, vol. 12, Martinus Nijhoff, 2012.

Reuter, Paul, *Introduction to the Law of Treaties*, London and New York, Kegan Paul International, 1995.

Sarooshi, Dan, *International Organizations and Their Exercise of Sovereign Powers*, Oxford University Press, 2005.

Simonet, Loïc and Oscar Arias Sanchez, *Le traité sur le commerce des armes*, A. Pedone (ed.), 2015.

Villager, Mark E., *Commentary on the 1969 Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties*, Martinus Nijhoff, 2008.

B. Articles and book chapters

____. *American Journal of International Law*, vol. 34 (1940) (Supplement).

Andrés Sáenz de Santa María, María Paz, "La aplicación provisional de los tratados internacionales en el derecho español", *Revista española de derecho internacional*, vol. 34, No. 1, 1982.

Arsanjani, Mahnoush H. and W. Michael Reisman, "Provisional application of treaties in international law: the energy charter treaty awards", in Enzo Cannizzaro (ed.), *The Law of Treaties Beyond the Vienna Convention*, Oxford University Press, 2011.

Ascensio, Hervé, "Article 70", in Olivier Corten and Pierre Klein (eds.), *The Vienna Conventions on the Law of Treaties: A Commentary*, vol. II, Oxford University Press, 2011.

Azaria, Danae, "Exception of non-performance" in *Max Planck Encyclopedia of Public International Law*, 2015.

Bartels, Lorand, "Withdrawing provisional application of treaties: has the EU made a mistake?", in *Cambridge Journal of International and Comparative Law*, vol. I, No. 1, 2012.

_____, Comments on provisional application, All Souls College, 2 December 2014.

Belz, Matthew, "Provisional application of the Energy Charter Treaty: *Kardassopoulos v. Georgia* and improving provisional application in multilateral treaties", *Emory International Law Review*, vol. 22, No. 2, fall, 2008.

Bothe, Michael, "Article 46" in Olivier Corten and Pierre Klein (eds.), *The Vienna Conventions on the Law of Treaties: A Commentary*, vol. II, Oxford University Press, 2011.

Cadilhac, Marie-Cécile, "Association UE-Ukraine: débuts mouvementés d'application provisoire pour un accord ambitieux", Revue trimestrielle de droit européen, Dalloz, 2015, pp. 220–227.

Casey-Maslen, Stuart, "Article 23: provisional application", in Stuart Casey-Maslen et al. (eds.), *The Arms Trade Treaty: A Commentary*, Oxford University Press, 2016.

Charney, J., "U.S. provisional application of the 1994 Deep Seabed Agreement", *American Journal of International Law*, vol. 88, No. 4, 1994, pp. 705–718.

Crnic-Grotic, V., "Object and purpose of treaties in the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties", *Asian Yearbook of International Law*, vol. 7, 1997.

Dalton, Robert E., "Provisional application of treaties" in Duncan B. Hollis (ed.), *The Oxford Guide to Treaties*, Oxford University Press, 2012.

Da Silva, Clare and Brian Wood, "Article 7: export and export assessment", in Clare da Silva and Brian Wood (eds.), *Weapons and International Law: The Arms Trade Treaty*, Larcier, 2015.

Do Nascimento e Silva, Geraldo Eulalio, "Le facteur temps et les traités", *The Hague Academy of International Law*, vol. 154, 1977, pp. 217–291.

Fahner, Johannes, "The empire strikes back: Yukos-Russia, 1-1", blog of the *European Journal of International Law*, 26 May 2016. Available at https://www.ejiltalk.org/the-empire-strikes-back-yukos-russia-1-1/.

Fitzmaurice, Malgosia and Anneliese Quast, *The International and Comparative Law Quarterly*, vol. 56, No. 2, 2007, pp. 468–470. Available at http://search.proquest.com/docview/236672245.

Fukui, Yasuhito, "Legal questions arising from its non-entry into force revisited", *Journal of Conflict and Security Law*, vol. 22, No. 2, July 2017, pp. 1–18.

Gamarra, Yolanda, "Current questions of State succession relating to multilateral treaties", in Pierre Michel Eisemann and Martti Koskenniemi (eds.), *State Succession: Codification Tested against the Facts*, Hague Academy of International Law, Martinus Nijhoff, 2000.

Hafner, Gerhard, "The 'provisional application' of the Energy Charter Treaty", *International Investment Law for the Twenty-first Century: Essays in Honour of Christoph Schreuer*, Oxford University Press, 2009, pp. 593–607.

Jacobsson, Marie G., "Syria and the issue of chemical weapons: a snapshot of a legal time-frame — the United Nations Security Council resolution 2118 (2013) and the OPCW Executive Council Decision" in Jonas Ebbesson et al. (eds.) *International Law and Changing Perceptions of Security*, Brill Nijhoff, 2014.

Jennings, Robert Y., "Treaties", in Mohammed Bedjaoui (ed.), *International Law: Achievements and Prospects*, Martinus Nijhoff, 1991.

Klaus, Ulrich, "The Yukos case under the Energy Charter Treaty and the provisional application of international treaties", in *Policy Papers on Transnational Economic Law*, No. 11, Martin Luther University, 2005.

Kohona, Palitha T. B., "Reservations: discussion of recent developments in the practice of the Secretary-General of the United Nations as depositary of multilateral treaties", *Georgia Journal of International and Comparative Law*, vol. 33, 2004–2005.

Koskenniemi, Martti, "Paragraph 3: Law of Treaties", in Pierre Michel Eisemann and Martti Koskenniemi (eds.), *State Succession: Codification Tested against the Facts*, Hague Academy of International Law, Martinus Nijhoff, 2000.

Krieger, Heike, "Article 25", in Oliver Dörr and Kirsten Schmalenbach (eds.), *The Vienna Conventions on the Law of Treaties: A Commentary*, Springer, 2012.

Lefeber, René, "The provisional application of treaties", in Jan Klabbers and René Lefeber (eds.) *Essays on the Law of Treaties: A Collection of Essays in Honour of Bert Vierdag*, Martinus Nijhoff, 1998.

_____, "Treaties, provisional application", R. Wolfrum (ed.), *The Max Planck Encyclopedia of Public International Law*, Oxford University Press, 2008.

Li, Fenghua, "The Yukos cases and the provisional application of the Energy Charter Treaty", *Cambridge International Law Journal*, vol. 6, No. 1, pp. 75–86.

Mathy, Denise, "Article 25", in Olivier Corten and Pierre Klein (eds.), *The Vienna Conventions on the Law of Treaties: A Commentary*, vol. I, Cambridge University Press, 2011.

Michie, Andrew, "The provisional application of arms control treaties", in *Journal of Conflict and Security Law*, vol. 10, No. 3, 2005.

_____, "The provisional application of treaties in South African law and practice", in *South African Yearbook of International Law*, vol. 30, 2005.

_____, "The role of provisionally applied treaties in international organisations", *The Comparative and International Law Journal of Southern Africa*, vol. 39, 2006.

_____, "Provisional application of non-proliferation treaties", in Daniel H. Joyner and Marco Roscini (eds.) *Non-Proliferation Law as a Special Regime*, first ed., Cambridge University Press, 2012.

Niebruegge, Alex M., "Provisional application of the Energy Charter Treaty: the Yukos arbitration and the future place of provisional application in international law", *Chicago Journal of International Law*, vol. 8, No. 1, 2007–2008.

Ouguergouz, Fatsah, Santiago Villalpando and Jason Morgan-Foster, "Article 77", in Olivier Corten and Pierre Klein (eds.), *The Vienna Conventions on the Law of Treaties: A Commentary*, vol. II, Oxford University Press, 2011.

Provost, René, "Article 73", in Olivier Corten and Pierre Klein (eds.), *The Vienna Conventions on the Law of Treaties: A Commentary*, vol. II, Oxford University Press, 2011.

Rogoff, Martin A. and Barbara E. Gauditz, "The provisional application of international agreements", in *Maine Law Review*, vol. 39, No. 1, 1987.

Rosenne, Shabtai, "More on the depositary of international treaties", *American Journal of International Law*, vol. 64.

_____, "The depositary of international treaties", *American Journal of International Law*, vol. 61, No. 4, October 1967.

Sagar, David, "Provisional application in an international organization", *Journal of Space Law*, vol. 27, No. 2, 1999.

Schaus, Annemie, "Article 27", in Olivier Corten and Pierre Klein (eds.), *The Vienna Conventions on the Law of Treaties: A Commentary*, vol. I, Oxford University Press, 2011.

Schenker, Claude, "L'application provisoire des traités: droit et pratique suisses", Schweizerische Zeitschrift für internationales und europäisches Recht: Revue suisse de droit international et européen, 2015, vol. 25, No. 2, 217–238.

Simma, Bruno and Tams, Christian J., "Article 60", in Olivier Corten and Pierre Klein (eds.), *The Vienna Conventions on the Law of Treaties: A Commentary*, vol. II, Oxford University Press, 2011.

Treves, Tullio, "L'entrée en vigueur de la Convention des Nations Unies sur le droit de la mer et les conditions de son universalisme", in *Annuaire français de droit international*, vol. XXXIX, 1993.

Vignes, Daniel, "Une notion ambigüe: l'application à titre provisoire des traités", *Annuaire français de droit international*, vol. 18, 1972.

Yihdego, Zeray, "Article 23: provisional application", in Clare da Silva and Brian Wood (eds.), *Weapons and International Law: The Arms Trade Treaty*, Larcier, 2015.

C. Case law

C/09/477160/HA ZA 15-1; C/09/477162/HA ZA 15-2; C/09/481619/HA ZA 15-112. Available at http://uitspraken.rechtspraak.nl/inziendocument?id=ECLI:NL:RBDHA:2016:4230.

Certain German Interests in Polish Upper Silesia, Merits, Judgment, P.C.I.J., series A, No. 7, 1926, at p. 19.

Corfu Channel case, Judgment of 9 April 1949, *I.C.J. Reports 1949*.

Factory at Chorzów, Judgment, P.C.I.J., series A, No. 9, 1927.

Gabčíkovo-Nagymaros Project (Hungary/Slovakia), Judgment, *I.C.J. Reports 1997*.

Ioannis Kardassopoulos v. Georgia, award on jurisdiction of 6 July 2007, ICSID Case No. ARB/05/18. Available at http://icsid.worldbank.org/ICSID/.

Military and Paramilitary Activities in and against Nicaragua (Nicaragua v. United States of America), Jurisdiction and Admissibility, Judgment, *I.C.J. Reports 1984*.

Military and Paramilitary Activities in and against Nicaragua (Nicaragua v. United States of America), Merits, Judgment, *I.C.J. Reports 1986*.

Nuclear Tests (Australia v. France), Judgment, *I.C.J. Reports 1974*, p. 253.

Permanent Court of Arbitration, *Yukos Universal Limited (Isle of Man) v. the Russian Federation*, Interim Award on Jurisdiction and Admissibility, 30 November 2009, case No. AA 227.

Phosphates in Morocco, Judgment, P.C.I.J., series A/B, No. 74, 1938, preliminary objections.

Reparation for injuries suffered in the service of the United Nations, Advisory Opinion, I.C.J. Reports 1949.

Reservations to the Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide, Advisory Opinion, I.C.J. Reports 1951.

S.S. "Wimbledon", Judgment, P.C.I.J., series A, No. 1, 1923.

The Diversion of Water from the Meuse, Judgment, P.C.I.J., series A/B, No. 70, 1937, dissenting opinion of M. Anzilotti.

D. Resolutions and decisions by international organizations

____. Decision (EU) 2017/38 of 28 October 2016 on the provisional application of the Comprehensive Economic and Trade Agreement between Canada, of the one part, and the European Union and its member States, of the other part, ibid., L 11, 14 January 2017, p. 1080.

____. FCCC/KP/AWG/2010/10, "Legal considerations relating to a possible gap between the first and subsequent commitment periods", 20 July 2010.

____. FCCC/KP/CMP/2012/13/Add.1, "Report of the Conference of the Parties serving as the meeting of the Parties to the Kyoto Protocol on its eighth session", held in Doha from 26 November to 8 December 2012, 28 February 2013.

____. FCCC/CP/2015/L.9, para. 5.

GATT, Report by the Panel, Canada — Import, distribution and sale of certain alcoholic drinks by provincial marketing agencies, DS17/R-39S/27, adopted on 18 February 1992.

GATT, Report of the Panel, Norway — Restrictions on imports of apples and pears, L/6474-36S/306, adopted on 22 June 1989.

GATT, Report of the Panel, Thailand — Restrictions on importation of and internal taxes on cigarettes, DS10/R-37S/200, adopted on 7 November 1990.

GATT, Report of the Panel, United States — Measures affecting alcoholic and malt beverages, DS23/R-39S/206, adopted on 19 June 1992.

General Assembly resolution 24 (I) of 12 February 1946.

General Assembly resolution 50/245.

General Assembly resolution 56/83 of 12 December 2001.

General Assembly resolution 67/234 B.

General Assembly resolution 97(1) of 14 December 1946, modified by General Assembly resolutions 364 (IV) of 1 December 1949, 482 (V) of 12 December 1955 and 33/141 of 19 December 1978.

Resolution establishing the Preparatory Commission for the Comprehensive Nuclear-Test-Ban Treaty Organization, CTBT/MSS/RES/1, adopted on 19 November 1996.

E. Other documents

____. "Syria's Accession to the Chemical Weapons Convention Enters into Force". Available at http://www.opcw.org/news/article/syrias-accession-to-the-chemical-weapons-convention-enters-into-force/.

____. Council of Europe and British Institute of International and Comparative Law (eds.), *Treaty making — expression of consent by States to be bound by a treaty*, Kluwer Law International, 2001.

____. Demo ratic security for all in Europe in challenging times. Tackling violent extremism and radicalisation leading to terrorism (CM/PV(2016)126-final), appendix 3, para. 3. Available at https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectID=09000016806c9744.

____. The treaty, protocols, conventions and supplementary acts of the Economic Community of West African States [1975–2010], Abuja, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, 2011.

A/AC.138/88, Report of the Secretary-General on examples of precedents of provisional application, pending their entry into force, of multilateral treaties, especially treaties which have established international organizations and/or regimes.

A/CN.4/683, Third report on subsequent agreements and subsequent practice in relation to the interpretation of treaties, by Georg Nolte, Special Rapporteur, 7 April 2015.

Michie, Andrew, The provisional application of treaties with special reference to arms control, disarmament and non-proliferation instruments, Master of Laws dissertation submitted at the University of South Africa, 2009.

Fourth report by G. G. Fitzmaurice, Special Rapporteur, document A/CN.4/120, in *Yearbook of the International Law Commission 1959*, vol. II.

Boletín Oficial del Estado No. 288 del 28 de noviembre de 2014. Secc. I, p. 96841.

Brierly, J. L., First Report on the Law of Treaties, document A/CN.4/23.

C.N.1021.2000.TREATIES-2 (Depositary Notification); available on the website of the United Nations Treaty Collection: https://treaties.un.org/doc/Treaties/1980/01/19800127%2000-52%20AM/Related%20Documents/CN.1021.2000-Eng.pdf .

CAHDI (2016) 8, of 12 February 2016.

Constitution of the Republic of Turkey. Available at: https://global.tbmm.gov.tr/docs/constitution_en.pdf.

Estonia Foreign Relations Act, adopted on 15 June 2006, RT I 2006, 32, 248, entered into force on 1 January 2007. Available at: https://www.riigiteataja.ee/en/eli/517012014001/consolide.

European Commission, press release of 30 November 2017, "Provisional application of new agreement between the European Union and Afghanistan signals new phase in cooperation". Available at http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release_IP-17-5008_en.htm.

Final Clauses of Multilateral Treaties: Handbook, United Nations publication, Sales No.: E.04.V.3, 2003.

Guide to Practice on Reservations to Treaties. Report of the International Law Commission on the work of its sixty-third session, supplement No. 10, A/66/10/Add.1.

International Law Association, Berlin Conference, 2004, Arms Control and Disarmament Law.

Journal officiel de la République française, No. 0125, 31 May 1997, 8415. The text of the circular is available at https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do?cidTexte=JORFTEXT000000200416.

Library of Congress, Report on the Law of the Sea Treaty: alternative approaches to provisional application, 93rd congress, 2nd session, House Committee on Foreign Affairs (4 March 1974) I.L.M., p. 456.

Réglementer clairement l'application à titre provisoire de traités internationaux: le Conseil fédéral prend position sur un rapport émanant de la Commission des institutions politiques du Conseil des Etats. Communiqués, DFJP, 19.02.2004. Available at http://www.ejpd.admin.ch/content/ejpd/fr/home/dokumentation/mi/2004/2004-02-19.html.

Repertory of Practice of United Nations Organs, Supplement No. 3, vol. IV, arts. 92–111 of the Charter (United Nations publication, Sales No.: E.73.V.2).

Repertory of Practice of United Nations Organs, vol. V, Articles 92–111 of the Charter (United Nations publication, Sales No: 1955.V.2 (vol. V)).

Strengthening and coordinating United Nations rule of law activities. Report of the Secretary-General, A/70/206, para. 11.

Summary of Practice of the Secretary-General as Depositary of Multilateral Treaties, ST/LEG/7/Rev.1 (United Nations publication, Sales No. E.94.V.15), paras. 237–241.

Summary of Practice of the Secretary-General as Depositary of Multilateral Treaties, ST/LEG/7/Rev.1 (United Nations publication, Sales No. E/94/V.5).

Third report on identification of customary international law, by Sir Michael Wood, Special Rapporteur, A/CN.4/682.

Treaty Handbook, United Nations publication, Sales No. E.12.V.1.

Vienna Convention on Succession of States in respect of Treaties (Vienna, 23 August 1978), United Nations, *Treaty Series*, vol. 1946, No. 33356, p. 125; in force since 6 December 1966.

Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties (Vienna, 23 May 1969), United Nations, *Treaty Series*, vol. 1155, No. 18232, p. 443.

Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties between States and International Organizations or between International Organizations (Vienna, 21 March 1986). E/CONF.129/15.

Yearbook of the International Law Commission 1959, vol. I, 487th meeting.

Yearbook ... 1962, vol. I, 668th meeting.

Yearbook ... 1962, vol. II, doc. A/5209.

Yearbook ... 1962, vol. II, A/CN.4/144.

Yearbook ... 1965, vol. I, 790th meeting.

Yearbook ... 1965, vol. II, doc. A/6009.

Yearbook ... 1966, doc. A/6309/Rev.1, part II.

Yearbook ... 1966, vol. II, doc. A/6309/Rev.1, part II, annex.

Yearbook ... 1966, vol. II (United Nations publication, Sales No. 67.V.2).

Yearbook ... 1974, vol. II (Part One), document A/CN.4/278.

Yearbook ... 2001, vol. II, Part Two (United Nations publication, Sales No. E.04.V.17 (Part 2)), as corrected.

Yearbook ... 2011, vol. II (Part Three).

Yearbook ... 2013, vol. II (Part One), document A/CN.4/664.

Yearbook ... 2014, vol. II (Part One), document A/CN.4/675.

Yearbook ... 2015, vol. II (Part One), document A/CN.4/687.

Yearbook ... 2015, vol. II (Part Two).